

SCRUTINY BOARD (CITY DEVELOPMENT)

TUESDAY, 9TH JUNE, 2009

PRESENT: Councillor R Pryke in the Chair

Councillors C Beverley, R Harington,
A Ogilvie, S Bentley, R Downes,
D Schofield and T Grayshon

1 Welcome

The Chair welcomed everyone to the first meeting of the Scrutiny Board (City Development) of the new municipal year and in particular new Members of the Board: Councillors Armitage, Murray, Bentley, Downes, Schofield and Grayshon.

2 Late Items

In accordance with his powers under Section 100B(4)(b) of the Local Government Act 1972, the Chair admitted to the agenda a late report from the Head of Scrutiny and Member Development entitled '**Statement on A660 Corridor Transport Issues**' (Minute No. 12 refers).

The report had not been included in the original agenda due to an oversight. However the Chair considered it appropriate to report the decision of the Executive Board on the Scrutiny Board's Statement on the A660 to the first meeting of the Board in the new municipal year.

The Chair also admitted to the agenda additional material received by the Board since the agenda despatch relevant to Item 10 – 'Request for Scrutiny of the Consultation Process carried out to determine whether to go ahead with a Designated BBQ Area on Woodhouse Moor'. This was the Director of City Development's report in response to the request for scrutiny entitled '**Woodhouse Moor Park Consultation on Barbecue Use**'. This report had been unavailable at agenda despatch as the Department had only had a couple of day's notice to produce the report.

The Chair advised that all the additional information had been circulated to Members of the Board prior to the meeting.

3 Declaration of Interests

Councillor Downes declared a personal interest in respect of Agenda Item 14, the Late Item 'Statement on A660 Corridor Transport Issues' (Minute No. 12 refers) in his capacity as Deputy Chair of Metro.

4 Apologies for Absence

Draft minutes to be approved at the meeting
to be held on Tuesday, 7th July, 2009

Apologies for absence were submitted on behalf of Councillors Lobley, Armitage and Wilkinson.

5 Minutes of Last Meeting

RESOLVED – That the minutes of the meeting held on 21st April 2009 be confirmed as a correct record.

6 Constitutional Amendments

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report providing Members with information and guidance on recent amendments of the Council's Constitution, as agreed by Council on 21st May 2009, which directly related to and/or impacted on the work of Scrutiny Boards.

The Principal Scrutiny Adviser presented the report and explained the difference between a **request for scrutiny** and a **Councillor Call for Action**; the latter being a mechanism of last resort.

RESOLVED –

- (a) That the amendments to the Council's Constitution outlined in the report be noted.
- (b) That the likely changes resulting from the Secretary of State regulations regarding the provision of information from partner authorities be noted.

7 Appointment of Co-opted Members

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report which sought Member's formal consideration for the appointment of co-opted members to the Scrutiny Board (City Development).

The Chair advised that up to five non-voting co-opted members could be appointed to the Scrutiny Board (City Development) for the municipal year, and/or up to two non-voting co-opted members who had some specialist skill or knowledge could be appointed on an ad hoc basis for particular inquiries.

The Board agreed that it was appropriate for this Board to **co-opt on an ad hoc basis** for individual inquiries, people with specialist expertise or from a particular lobbying group.

RESOLVED – That the Board consider appointing up to two non-voting co-optees per individual inquiry.

8 Input to the Work Programme 2009/10 - Sources of Work and Establishing the Board's Priorities

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report with attached appendices, providing Members with information and guidance to assist the Board in developing its work programme for 2009/10.

The Chair welcomed Ed Mylan, Chief Officer (Resources and Strategy) and Paul Stephens, Chief Economic Development Officer, who were attending the meeting on behalf of the Director City Development who was unavailable. It was reported that Paul Maney, Head of Policy, Performance and Improvement had intended to attend today's meeting but was ill. Councillor A Carter, Executive Board Member for Development and Regeneration and Councillor J Procter, Executive Board Member for Leisure had both submitted their apologies due to prior commitments.

Officers responded to Members' questions and discussed possible items for inclusion in the Board's work programme.

The Chief Officer (Resources and Strategy) advised Members that all the Chief Officers within the City Development Directorate had been invited to put forward items they would like to see on the Board's work programme.

Members commented on and sought further clarification from the Chief Officers on particular issues for possible inclusion in the Board's future work programme. In summary, discussion centred around the following topics:

- **Climate change and reducing carbon emissions:**
 - Making Council property and equipment more energy efficient – use of solar power, educating staff to save energy
 - Improving the efficiency of street lighting
 - Energy monitors available to borrow from Otley Library

Members agreed to receive a **report to the September meeting** of the Board on City Council **initiatives to reduce carbon emissions with a** view to undertaking further scrutiny.

- **Transport:**
 - Improving public transport and encouraging people not to use cars
 - Lack of park and ride schemes

The Board was advised that the Chief Highways Officer would be consulting with the Board in the Autumn on the Leeds City Region Transport Strategy Vision.

- **Leisure Centres:**
 - Members were advised that a report on the **Vision for Sport** would be submitted to the July meeting of the Executive Board. Scrutiny Board requested input to the 5 year vision and to undertake some further scrutiny.
 - Members were updated on the concept of a **Trust** running the leisure centres and the reasons for it not being progressed at this stage..

- The **free swimming initiative** for under 16s and over 60s – Members were advised that the Council had been compensated by the Government and received some capital monies. It was reported that this initiative was to have cost the Council approximately £50,000 but because a number of authorities had declined an invitation to participate in this scheme, the Council had received a bigger share of the available funds and the cost was now almost zero.
- **Visits:**
 - The Chair suggested that arrangements be made for members of the Board to visit South Leeds Sports Centre, John Charles Aquatic Centre, the building site of the new well being PFI sports centre at Morley and Roundhay Park Mansion prior to its official opening.
- **City Centre Conference:**
 - Improving **Signage** in Leeds City Centre.

Members agreed to receive a **report** to a future Board meeting to update members on the work being undertaken to improve signage in the station area and city centre following the **City Centre Conference**.

- **Attendance at Concert Venues:**
 - In response to Members' concerns regarding the under use of concert venues in the city and the high average age of the audience at orchestral performances in general, it was agreed that a **report** be submitted to a future meeting of the Board on the **use of cultural venues** and initiatives to encourage attendance by young people.
- **Promotion of Events:**
 - Members expressed **concerns** about how Leeds presented and marketed itself and provided examples of events and venues being poorly advertised. Officers advised that this was in part a budgetary issue, but that events were advertised and promoted and that many events were nevertheless over subscribed. Members should advise the officers if there were concerns over specific events.
 - Members were advised that the main focus of **Marketing Leeds** was the promotion of Leeds on the international stage, not the promotion of specific events, although the emphasis of Marketing Leeds could be changed by Leeds City Council.
 - Members suggested Marketing Leeds submit a report on the work it undertook to promote the city nationally and internationally and whether it could undertake further promotional work of specific events in the city.
- **Accessibility by Public Transport to Hospitals:**
 - Members were advised that discussions between LCC, Metro and NHS always took place as to public transport accessibility to hospital sites as part of the planning process.

- **Review of Libraries:**

- Members indicated they wanted a report updating them on progress to review libraries with a view to undertaking further scrutiny.
- **Playbuilder Initiative:**
 - Members were advised that there was a report to Executive Board in June on a programme to build or significantly refurbish play facilities in Leeds. The Board requested to see this report.
- **Agenda for an Improved Economic Performance:**
 - Officers advised that a report on the Agenda for an Improved Economic Performance would be presented to the Executive Board in July. It was anticipated that the Scrutiny Board (City Development) would be involved in this consultation in late 2009.
 - In response to a query, Officers advised that there were procedures in place with Job Centre Plus if there were a mass of sudden redundancies in Leeds.
- **Planning:**
 - It was reported that the Chief Planning Officer would like to review the method by which public consultation of planning applications were advertised and the Board agreed to undertake scrutiny of this matter later in the year.
- **Conservation Unit:**
 - The Board indicated that it wished to review the Conservation Unit and progress in undertaking conservation area surveys and to include this in the Board's work programme

RESOLVED –

- (a) That the report, appendices and information discussed be noted with a view to developing the Board's work programme.
- (b) That reports on the following topics be included in the Board's Work Programme:
 - Climate Change and Initiatives to reduce carbon emissions – September meeting.
 - Leeds City Region Transport Strategy Vision.
 - Leeds' Vision for Sport.
 - Improving Signage in the City Centre following the City Centre Conference.
 - Concert Venues.
 - Promotion of venues and events and Marketing Leeds.
 - Playbuilder Initiative.
 - Review of Libraries.
 - Agenda for Improved Economic Performance Review - late 2009.
 - Review of advertising of planning applications.
 - Conservation Unit and Conservation Area Surveys.
- (c) That arrangements be made for members of the Board to visit South Leeds Sports Centre, John Charles Aquatic Centre, the building site

of the new well being PFI sports centre at Morley and Roundhay Park Mansion on a day which was not a Board meeting.

9 Request for Scrutiny of the Consultation Process carried out to determine whether to go ahead with a Designated BBQ Area on Woodhouse Moor

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report notifying Members of a request for scrutiny which had been received from Ward Councillors representing Hyde Park and Woodhouse Ward and Headingley Ward. The request for scrutiny concerned the consultation process carried out to determine whether to go ahead with a designated BBQ area on Woodhouse Moor.

The Chair welcomed to the meeting Councillors Hamilton and Matthews from Headingley Ward and Councillor Ewens from Hyde Park and Woodhouse Ward.

Due to the unavailability of the Director of City Development, Sean Flesher, Acting Head of Parks and Countryside, was welcomed to the meeting to respond to this request for scrutiny and present the Department's report.

On behalf of Headingley and Hyde Park and Woodhouse Ward Councillors, Councillor Hamilton was invited to explain to the Board the reasons for the request to scrutiny.

Councillor Hamilton summarised the background to the issue and local Ward Members' concerns. The Board were advised that concerns centred around the validity and integrity of the survey, in particular **whether the questionnaire was delivered** and received by all householders in the 800m catchment area around the Park. Also of concern was the fact that the survey was distributed when a significant part of the population (ie **students**) **might not have been present** and that the survey did not have a **return date**.

The Acting Head of Parks and Countryside summarised the rationale and process of the consultation exercise as outlined in the Department's report and responded to queries and comments from the Board.

After lengthy discussion and questioning of witnesses by Members of the Board, it was agreed that **further information** was necessary in order to ascertain whether the consultation had been carried out correctly and consequently whether to accept or refuse the request for scrutiny.

The additional information, by way of a **report**, was to be provided to the **July meeting** of the Scrutiny Board (City Development) and should include the following information:

- The total number of completed questionnaires returned.
- A list of the streets where completed questionnaires had been returned.
- A list of all the streets in the 800m catchment area.

- The benefits and disadvantages of the Department carrying out the survey again.
- How the questionnaire was delivered ie was it in an envelope and if so, was it addressed personally to residents.
- How many returned questionnaires were found to be photocopies.

Members also requested that a representative of DBS, **the distributors of the questionnaire**, be invited to attend the July meeting of the Board.

RESOLVED –

- (a) That the report and request for scrutiny by Ward Councillors representing Hyde Park and Woodhouse Ward and Headingley Ward be noted.
- (b) That the response report of the Director of City Development be noted.
- (c) That a further report be requested of the Director of City Development to the July meeting of the Board, in order to assist Members in their decision to either refuse or accept the request for scrutiny. The report to include information as listed above.
- (d) That a representative of DBS be invited to attend the July meeting of the Board.

10 KPMG - Scrutiny Review - May 2009

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report which presented the findings of the recent KPMG external audit review of the Scrutiny function in Leeds. The report also detailed management's response to the review's recommendations.

The Chair welcomed to the meeting Peter Marrington, Head of Scrutiny and Member Development, to present the report and outline management's responses to the review's recommendations.

In brief summary Members discussed and the sought the Head of Scrutiny and Member Development's views on the following issues:

- Methods by which to encourage better attendance of Members at **pre-meetings** and to use the time more wisely.
- The **politicisation of Scrutiny**, particularly the rules for calling-in decisions.
- The inclusion of **co-optees** on Scrutiny Boards.
- How realistic **one item agendas** were.

RESOLVED –

- (a) That the recommendations of the recent KPMG external audit review of the Scrutiny function in Leeds be noted.
- (b) That the management response to the review's recommendations be noted.

11 Determining the Work Programme 2009/10

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report requesting Members determine the Board's work programme for 2009/10.

The Chair advised that Councillor A Carter, Executive Board Member for Development and Regeneration and Councillor J Procter, Executive Board Member for Leisure, had both been unable to attend today's meeting due to prior commitments, however they would be invited to the July meeting of the Board.

The Principal Scrutiny Adviser advised that it was intended that the Board visited the **Mansion House** in Roundhay Park before it opened to the public.

Training of Scrutiny Members on **Performance Management** and information on **income generated by events** were also requested to be included in the work programme.

With regard to the remainder of the Board's work programme for 2009/10, the Principal Scrutiny Adviser was requested by the Chair to formulate a draft work programme incorporating the items discussed under this agenda item and agenda item 9 (Minute No. 8 refers), and any other suggestions notified to him by email from Members.

RESOLVED

- (a) That the Executive Board Member for Development and Regeneration and the Executive Board Member for Leisure be invited to attend the July meeting of the Board.
- (b) That the Principal Scrutiny Adviser formulate a draft work programme for the Members of the Board to consider, taking into account the items discussed as above and under agenda item 9, and any other suggestions notified to him by email from Members.

12 Late Item - Statement on A660 Corridor Transport Issues

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a late report advising Members of the decision of the Executive Board to the Scrutiny Board (City Development)'s recommendations following its Statement on the A660 Corridor Transport Issues.

The Principal Scrutiny Adviser presented the report and advised that the Executive Board had agreed the recommendations and that the City Development Department were now implementing them. Progress on meeting the recommendations would be monitored by the Scrutiny Board (City Development) on a quarterly basis, with the first reports being received at the July meeting.

RESOLVED –

- (a) That the response of the Executive Board to the Scrutiny Board (City Development)'s Statement in 2008/09 be noted.
- (b) That the arrangements for monitoring progress on the implementation of the recommendations be noted.

13 Dates and Times of Future Meetings

RESOLVED – The dates and times of future meetings of the Board were noted as:

9th June 2009, 7th July 2009, 1st September 2009, 13th October 2009, 10th November 2009, 8th December 2009, 12th January 2010, 9th February 2010, 9th March 2010 and 6th April 2010. All meetings at 10.00am with a pre-meeting for Board Members at 9.30am.

The meeting concluded at 12.25 pm.